CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF MARCH 26, 2015 202 C STREET, CITY ADMINISTRATION BUILDING COUNCIL COMMITTEE ROOM, 12th FLOOR SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:04PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Present
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Absent
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Absent
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Evelya Rivera	Absent
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary

Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner Jodie Brown, Senior Planner

Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner Joseph Castro, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Heather Ferbert, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for February 26, 2015

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 26, 2015 AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer Vote: 6-0-1 Motion Passes

(Marrone)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

ABSENCES

Boardmembers Berge, Curry and Rivera have notified Staff they would not be in attendance. Boardmember Larimer has to leave at 4:00pm.

.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 26, 2015 Page 2 of 6

• OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION

- ✓ Request for Continuance for Item 5-1508-1544 E Street
- ✓ Draft February 26, 2015 Minutes
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

Vice-Chair Garbini announced that the San Diego Chapter of the American Society of Landscape Architecture is forming a Historic Preservation Committee. The committee will be identifying significant local landscapes with the intent that a HALS be provided for them. The HALS is the Historic American Landscape Survey, through the National Park Service. The intent is to identify, document and record the significant designed and cultural landscapes across the United States.

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Chair Lemmo has a conflict of interest for Item 5- 1508-1544 E Street.

• EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

• FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- I am very, very happy to introduce our highly anticipated new Associate Planner, Joseph Castro. Joseph is a licensed architect who worked for Heritage Architecture and Planning for 6 years and meets the US Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualifications in the field of Historic Architecture. Joseph was most recently employed by the City's Development Services Department, where he worked as a Combination Inspector over the past year. Joseph brings a highly valuable skill set to the historical resources section, and we are very excited to have him as part of our team!
- It is HRB Annual Awards season once again! The City is currently accepting nominations for the 2015 Historic Preservation Awards. Awards are given each year in the categories of Agency; Archaeology; Architectural Restoration, Rehabilitation and Reconstruction; Community History; Cultural Diversity; Cultural Landscape; Education; History; Individual and Preservation Advancement. Nominations are due by April 3rd, and the Awards will be presented at the May 28th HRB Hearing. Nomination forms are available online and on the City's website.
- As a reminder, the Mills Act application period is currently open, and closes on March 31st. The application and more information is available on our website.
- The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting will be held Wednesday, April 1, 2015 at 4:00 PM in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services. The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, April 13, 2015 at 3:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, May 11, 2015.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 26, 2015 Page 3 of 6

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The Owner of Item 5-1508-1544 E Street is asking for a 60-day continuance to the May 2015 agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEM 5-1508-1544 E STREET FOR 60-DAYS TO THE MAY 2015 AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

The Owner of Item 11-1515 West Lewis Street is asking for a 30-day continuance to the April 2015 agenda.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEM 11-1515 WEST LEWIS STREET FOR 30-DAYS TO THE APRIL 2015 AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 10 – WILLIAM SMITH SPEC HOUSE #1

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE ITEM 10 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 9 - 6752-6762 TYRIAN STREET

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE ITEM 9 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

INFORMATION ITEMS

ITEM A – FEE STUDY FOR MILLS ACT PROGRAM

Staff will present information related to a proposed minor increase in fees related to the Mills Act Program, which are proposed as part of the FY2016 Comprehensive User Fee Update.

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – THE JAMES COLLUMB AUTO SALES AND SERVICE BUILDING

Continued from June 2013

Applicant: L2HP represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Owner: Navarra Properties Broadway LP

Location: 1508-1544 E Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (1289 3-C)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1508-1544 E Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate The James Collumb Auto Sales and Service Building located at 1508-1544 E Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1919-1956 under HRB Criterion A.

Report Number: Memo dated March 12, 2015 and Staff Report Number HRB 13-026

CONTINUED TO THE MAY 2015 AGENDA AT THE OWNERS REQUEST

ITEM 6 – 3127 MCKINLEY STREET

Continued from February 2015

Applicant: Justin Clapper represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 3127 McKinley Street, 92104, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 7-F)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3127 McKinley Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the property located at 3127 McKinley Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: Memo dated February 20, 2015 and Staff Report Number HRB 15-006

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Kiley Wallace, Dan Soderberg, Ron May, Alexandra Wallace, Betty Willis

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO CONTINUE ITEM 6-3127 MCKINLEY STREET FOR 60-DAYS TO THE MAY 2015 AGENDA AT THE APPLICANTS REQUEST

Motion Passes

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas Vote: 7-0-0

ITEM 7 – MUT KULA XUY/MUT LAH HOY YA SITE #8

Applicant: Frank and Sharon Arthofer represented by Brian F. Smith and Associates

Location: Address Restricted, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

Description: Consider the designation of the property above as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Mut kula xuy/Mut lah hoy ya Site #8 as a historical resource under HRB Criterion A. The designation applies to the site only and excludes the 1951 one-story residence and all other above-ground structures currently located on the premises.

Report Number: HRB 15-020

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 26, 2015 Page 5 of 6

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Brian Smith

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER SILVAS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – MUT KULA XUY/MUT LAH HOY YA SITE #8 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Chair Lemmo Vote: 7-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – 1641 CRESPO DRIVE

Applicant: Donald Brown II and Jane Mallory represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1641 Crespo Drive, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1227 6-G)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1641 Crespo Drive as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the property located at 1641 Crespo Drive under any adopted HRB

Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 15-016 Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia, Brian Will, Donald Brown

In Opposition: None **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8-1641 CRESPO DRIVE UNDER CRITERION D AS A NOTABLE WORK OF MASTER ARCHITECT JOHN LLOYD WRIGHT WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1959; REFLECTING THE MODERN CONTEMPORARY STYLE AND CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES SUCH AS AN ASYMMETRICAL, IRREGULARLY-SHAPED (TRIANGULAR), MULTI-LEVEL PLAN; FLAT ROOFS WITH WIDE EAVE OVERHANGS AND EXPOSED RAFTERS; BOARD AND BATTEN AND UNREINFORCED CONCRETE BLOCK OVER WOOD FRAME CONSTRUCTION; AND A CONCRETE AND BRICK FOUNDATION SUPPORTING THE FLOOR JOISTS AND SUBFLOOR.

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini Vote: 3-4-0 Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Larimer, Marrone, Baksh)

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 26, 2015 Page 6 of 6

ITEM 9 – 6752-6762 TYRIAN STREET

Applicant: F M R E LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 6752-6762 Tyrian Street, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 2-E)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 6752-6762 Tyrian Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the property located at 6752-6762 Tyrian Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 15-017
ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 10 – WILLIAM SMITH SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Nicole M. Hartman represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 3540 Granada Avenue, 92104, Greater North Park, Council District 3 (1269 6-E)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3540 Granada Avenue as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the William Smith Spec House #1 located at 3540 Granada Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1923 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes 204 square-foot addition to rear of house and 71 square-foot addition to detached garage.

Report Number: HRB 15-019

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 11 – NATHAN RIGDON SPEC HOUSE #3 (HRB# 1113)

Applicant: Elizabeth Willis Revocable Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc

Location: 1515 West Lewis Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1268 5-H)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the Amendment of the Nathan Rigdon Spec House #3 (HRB #1113) located at 1515 West Lewis Street to include Designation under HRB Criterion B.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Amend the designation of the Nathan Rigdon Spec House #3 (HRB #1113) to include designation under HRB Criterion B or do not amend the designation to include designation under HRB Criterion B.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not amend the designation of the Nathan Rigdon Spec House #3 (HRB Site #1113) located at 1515 West Lewis Street to include designation under HRB Criterion B.

Report Number: HRB 15-013

CONTINUED TO THE APRIL 2015 AGENDA AT THE OWNERS REQUEST

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, April 23, 2015

LOCATION: North Terrace Rooms, San Diego Concourse